Bibliography on HIV/AIDS in Ethiopia and Ethiopians in the Diaspora: The 2005 Update

Paul J. Converse¹, Mesfin Samuel Mulatu², Helmut Kloos³, Damen Haile Mariam⁴, Tadesse Wuhib⁵, and Alula Pankhurst⁶

Introduction
This is the third update of the bibliography on HIV/AIDS in Ethiopia and Ethiopians in the Diaspora, which was originally published in this journal in 2003. That bibliography covered published and unpublished work on HIV/AIDS and related health conditions (e.g., other sexually transmitted infections, tuberculosis) for the period 1972 to 2002. A follow-up update, published in early 2004, covered additional references that appeared in 2002 and 2003. The second update extended the bibliography to cover references not listed in the previous two and those that appeared later in 2004.

As in the previous bibliographies, this update includes references to biomedical, clinical, epidemiological, psychosocial, socio-economic, cultural, behavioral, impact, intervention, and evaluation studies on HIV/AIDS and relevant research on sexually transmitted infections (STIs), tuberculosis, and other co-infections in Ethiopia and Ethiopians in the Diaspora. Also included are studies dealing with sexual and contraceptive behaviors, and socio-cultural practices or conditions that increase the vulnerability of Ethiopians to HIV and associated opportunistic infections, including research on conditions of street and orphan children, sexual harassment and violence on women, and traditional practices (e.g., early marriage, female genital cutting) and their consequences. Although the number of reports on the possibility of a protective role for male circumcision continues to accumulate from other countries in Africa, we have not found any published studies evaluating this topic in Ethiopia, where practices may differ from one community to another and where this surgery is typically done in infancy rather than at puberty as in other East African countries.

The same strategies were used as in the three previous bibliographies to identify and catalog the references. First, all new references that appeared in 2005 were searched in major databases, including MEDLINE, PsyCILit, and POPLINE using the key words “Ethiopia and HIV,” “Ethiopia and AIDS”, “Ethiopia and reproductive health”, “Ethiopia and sexual behavior”, and, this year, "HIV in Israel". Second, journals that were not indexed by these database systems (e.g., Ethiopian Journal of Health Development and Ethiopian Journal of Health Sciences) were manually inspected for relevant references. Third, websites of major HIV/AIDS conferences (e.g., http://www.aids2005.org), national or regional HIV/AIDS resource centers (e.g., http://www.etharc.org) and international organizations (e.g., http://www.unaids.org) were searched for conference abstracts and reports on HIV/AIDS in Ethiopia or Ethiopians in the Diaspora. Fourth, lists of 2005 Master's theses were obtained from the departments of Community Health (Medical Faculty), Sociology and Anthropology, Geography, Psychology and the Demographic Training and Research Center, all of Addis Ababa University. Once all the 2005 references were selected and cataloged, similar searches for older references were made. For the sake of the completeness of the bibliographies in this series, references dated between 1984 and 2004 were identified and compared with the databases of references created for the original and the first update. Relevant references that were not listed in the previous bibliographies were retained and included in the present update.

Of the total 153 references identified and included in this bibliography, 123 (80.4%) appeared in 2005. Of the 153, there are 78 (51%) journal articles, 9 (5.9%) books, 4 (2.6%) reports, 11 (7.2%) conference abstracts, and 50 (32.7%) student theses and dissertations. There are 20 (13.1%) MPH theses and 27 (17.6%) MA theses from Addis Ababa University (AAU), two doctoral dissertations (2003 and 2004) from American universities, and another doctoral thesis from the University of Amsterdam (2005). Additional references, not listed here, representing student work from Jimma University in the years 1991-2004 are available in the undated (presumably 2005) Alemayehu and Belachew volumes cited in the bibliography section. It is hoped that these are available at university libraries at the Ethiopian AIDS Resource Center. Selected HIV/AIDS-related references from these abstract books can also be found in an EndNote bibliographic file at the EJHD website (http://www.cih.uib.no/journals/EJHD/). The internet, of course, continues to be a major source of information, and this update again includes a separate section that consists of 10 websites that continue to provide useful information and downloadable documents on HIV/AIDS in Ethiopia and Ethiopians in the Diaspora.

¹Center for Tuberculosis Research, Johns Hopkins University, School of Medicine, Baltimore, MD 21231, USA; ²Center for Community Prevention and Treatment Research, The MayaTech Corporation, Atlanta, Georgia 30324, USA; ³Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics, University of California, Medical Center, San Francisco, San Francisco, CA 94143, USA; ⁴Department of Community Health, Medical Faculty, Addis Ababa University, P.O. Box 32812, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia; ⁵U. S. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Ethiopia, P. O. Box 1014, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia; ⁶Department of Sociology and Anthropology, Addis Ababa University, P. O. Box 1176, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
This year’s update contains fewer references than in some of the previous years, in part perhaps due to the presence of fewer Ministry of Health reports as well as conference abstracts. However, there also appears to be a slight decline in the number of references for “Ethiopia and HIV” cited in PubMed (http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/entrez/query.fcgi?db=PubMed). These numbers peaked at 37 in 2002 (Fig. 1A).

Figure 1: PubMed citations related to Ethiopia and HIV. (A) PubMed was queried for "Ethiopia and HIV and year [dp]" or, instead of HIV, AIDS or tuberculosis, or the probably unrelated diseases, schistosomiasis or malaria. (B) Publications concerning "Ethiopia and HIV and year [dp]" going back to the beginning of the HIV/AIDS epidemic in Ethiopia in the mid-1980s

Basic Biomedical Research

Only 11 (7.2%) of the references deal with basic biomedical research, a greater than 50% drop in the number of journal articles and a 71% drop overall from the previous update. Many of these studies concerned analysis of HIV subtypes that predominate in Ethiopia as well as parameters related to host responses such as CD4+ cells and HIV co-receptors. Many of these articles were studies conducted under the auspices of ENARP. Given the discontinuation of support for this research group, it is not clear how many of the Ethiopian scientists have been incorporated into the parent organization, the Ethiopian Health and Nutrition Research Institute (EHNRI), and other research institutes and whether further declines in this sort of work is to be expected in future updates. There is certainly much to be learned about the biology of the HIV pathogen and host responses in Ethiopia, especially in the context of pressure on both resulting from the introduction of antiretroviral treatment.

Epidemiological, Risk Factors, and Determinants Research

The epidemiology section again contains the largest number (N=65 or 42.5%) of references in this update. The percentage is higher than the previous update. This section includes 8 articles that appeared in a special issue of the Ethiopian Journal of Health Sciences in 2004. These reports provide a significant source of information on aspects of the epidemic outside of Addis Ababa. There are 52 references in this section that were published in 2005. Citation #22 in this section is for a book published in 1991, based on the 1973-1974 analysis, and 1978 dissertation of Laketch Dirasse, which came to the attention of the compilers in the past year and is summarized here since it is probably not a widely available treatise. This socioanthropological dissertation uses key informant and participant observation techniques and provides a valuable description of the organization of prostitution, a major HIV risk factor, in Addis Ababa in the final years of the imperial period, just a decade before the onset of the HIV epidemic, as well as describing the antecedent forms that had greatly expanded during periods of European influence, especially during the Italian occupation and the elaboration of the British economic model in the post-World War II period. The estimates of the extent of prostitution in the capital probably remain controversial but the methods do indicate how the author arrived at the figures. The extent to which the types of prostitution persist to this day are unknown to the compilers of the bibliography but this dissertation may provide starting material for contemporary investigations. We would also like to point out the very interesting doctoral thesis concerning the sexuality of males in Dessie and completed in 2005. Using observation, in-depth interviews, focus group discussions, and a quantitative questionnaire in his ethnographic research, Getnet Tadele...
concluded that HIV/AIDS prevention measures need to be grounded in broader sexuality issues including both their fears, pleasures, and dilemmas associated with this aspect of young men’s lives. Protecting young people from the disease will require a socio-economic environment that would ideally include training and employment opportunities but realistically programme managers and youth will need to draw their own conclusions about the risks and their responses to the HIV epidemic. Further information on the contents of these theses can be found in the EndNote file on the EJHD website. The dearth of data on human papilloma virus (HPV) infection and cervical cancer, noted in last year’s update has now been reversed in part with the paper by B.E. Fanta who found that HPV is implicated in nearly all cervical cancers in Ethiopia and that type 16, the most common type in Europe and America, accounts for over 76% of cases, suggesting that a vaccine against HPV16 could have a substantial impact in Ethiopia, too. It still remains to be determined if HIV infection increases the transition from HPV infection to cancer as has been suggested in very recent studies from Senegal (S. Hawes et al., 2006) and Thailand (L. Bollen et al., 2006).

Clinical Research
There are 21 clinical research papers dealing with people living with HIV/AIDS and the accompanying opportunistic infections are included and represent 13.7% of the references in this update, an increase over the previous bibliographies. Two of the papers concerned Jimma and were published in Ethiopian health journals. One of the papers concerned disease manifestations in children in Gondar while another considers the impact of HIV infection on vivax and falciparum malaria presentation. Only one reference is concerned with antiretroviral (ARV) drug resistance in this section of the update. The UNAIDS (see Epidemiology section) reported that in April, 2005, approximately 16,400 individuals were receiving ARV and that, as of December, 2004, there were an estimated 211,000 in need of treatment. With the expansion of ARV treatment programs throughout the country, we would expect more attention to be given to clinical aspects of the epidemic; thus, future updates are very likely to include more clinical studies.

Impacts Research
A higher percentage (7.8%) of the references (N=12) are related to the impact of the HIV epidemic on the broader society as well as particular subgroups in this year’s update compared to previous years. Most are student theses from Addis Ababa University and all are from 2005. The mechanisms appear to be present and utilized for students to spend time in communities and accessing various databases to assess these impacts. This is a commendable trend and may be extended to the impact of ARV treatment on various economically important sectors of the society. Not included here are theses from Jimma that are particularly noteworthy in this field and in others in that they provide information from communities outside of the capital and from which the student may in fact come. The grassroots perspectives on problems and issues that these individuals, who are well integrated into the affected communities, bring could be of benefit to other researchers and to the effective implementation of intervention strategies. We would like to highlight an in press study by Alula Pankhurst, Andargatchew Tesfaye, Ayalew Gebre, Bethlehem Takola, and Habtamu Demille that bridges the impacts and intervention categories by identifying the impact that the epidemic has had on commercial sex workers, iddir organizations, and people living with AIDS and carefully examining their coping behavior. There has been a tendency to portray them as passive victims who have not been responding proactively. This study questions these assumptions and documents recent responses and ways in which these groups have been coping with the challenges of stigma, discrimination, loss of or altered means of livelihood, household dismemberment and dislocation, dependence on assistance, and stresses on the strength and functioning of community institutions. Resilient individuals in these groups have reacted with solidarity, mutual self-help, and advocacy for practices benefiting not only themselves but the community at large. The study recommends that health planners and researchers interested in identifying viable participants in community-based intervention activities and programs will step up efforts to incorporate these human resources into intervention activities and programs. The study also concludes that although civil society actors have been hailed as having an important role to play in addressing the HIV/AIDS epidemic, most initiatives and funding so far have been mainly in the hands of the government organizations and foreign NGOs, with relatively little collaboration with civil society organizations.

Interventions Research
There is again a good representation of publications (N=23, 15%) concerned with interventions to contain the epidemic. About one-fourth have been produced by students and 4 are from the Ministry of Health. Much more such work will be expected in the production of protocols for implementation and plans to monitor treatment compliance and efficacy with the advent of ARV therapy.

Monitoring and Evaluation Research
The percentage (7.8%) of references (N=12) concerned with the evaluation of interventions and programs related to the HIV epidemic and associated infectious diseases and sexual and reproductive issues is also much higher than in previous years. However, we would stress again the importance of increasing this sort of work and the proportion of research efforts in order to determine what
really works in combating the clinical, social, and economic aspects of HIV and AIDS. Stephen Lewis, the United Nations Special Envoy for HIV/AIDS in Africa, has related (personal communication, January, 2006), how the Patriarch suggested that there are over 300,000 priests available for health education in Ethiopia and that the UN has begun a training program so that this valuable national resource can work to counteract the epidemic. Studies can be envisioned to describe the KAP of priests in different communities, to outline the nature of the intervention program, and to evaluate the effectiveness of their educational message.

Research on HIV/AIDS in Ethiopians in the Diaspora

The compilers found only one report related to this topic in 2005 and only after searching “HIV in Israel”. This strategy also identified a reference (2002) not included previously. Earlier bibliographies included a number of studies related to Ethiopian migrants to Israel. The Diaspora community has made some contributions to assist with interventions on HIV/AIDS in Ethiopia, including teleconferencing on clinical questions between physicians in North America and those in Addis Ababa. Apart from unpublished reports and slide presentations in specific communities in the U.S., there is not much in the way of hard evidence to indicate the scope of the problem among Ethiopians overseas. It seems simplistic to assume that appropriate treatment and care are being received and administered to the immigrant community by the existing health care systems.

Conclusion

The distribution of the references in the various categories follows the trend from basic biomedical and epidemiological/KAP research to intervention studies, as reported in previous updates of this bibliography. Although the earlier pattern of the relatively small number of monitoring and evaluation, and HIV/AIDS impact studies continues, there has been gradual movement in the upward direction for the evaluation and impact categories. Much greater efforts should be made to assess the situation in the Diaspora, particularly outside of Israel, where the issue has been virtually untouched by research. Although the emphasis on intervention studies is highly desirable in view of the implementation of antiretroviral drug provision, there is an increasing need to monitor and periodically evaluate the impacts of HIV/AIDS on individuals, families and communities, as well as the situation of Ethiopians living in other countries. There will also be an even more critical need to evaluate the effects of treatment on individuals, their behavior, and the overall epidemic. Such studies can contribute to the optimization of the cost-effectiveness and coverage of intervention programs in Ethiopia and in countries with large Ethiopian immigrant and refugee populations.

It appears that the quantity, diversity of topics, and population coverage of student research on HIV/AIDS related issues is growing. Although space did not allow in this update to include over 100 titles of undergraduate research, we have noticed that undergraduate and graduate students from Addis Ababa University and Jimma University (References 1 and 2 in the Earlier Bibliographies section below) have investigated not only HIV/AIDS related knowledge, attitudes and behaviors, but also issues surrounding voluntary testing and counseling, parent-child communication patterns, sexual violence, and others that have hitherto been less studied. More importantly, student research has also expanded the type of population studied from predominantly secondary school student, commercial sex worker, and prenatal clinic attendees in major urban areas to other groups including HIV/AIDS patients and their families, soldiers in training or at their bases, and rural residents in various parts of the country. In order to improve the quantity, quality, and significance of student research to HIV/AIDS science and public health practice, we strongly recommend that graduating students in relevant social and health sciences fields be encouraged to continue to engage in these types of studies, that they be given adequate methodological, substantive, and research support and supervision, and that they get the opportunity to share their findings and experiences with larger audiences in the form of publication in refereed journals and conferences. An EndNote file listing undergraduate students and their research titles is available at the EJHD website. Mentors at other Ethiopian universities are encouraged to contact the authors about their students’ research related to the HIV/AIDS epidemic so that they can be posted on the journal’s website or other appropriate websites such as that of the Ethiopian AIDS Resource Center.

Acknowledgements

Dr. Assefa Hailemariam, Demographic Training and Research Center, AAU, Dr. Muluneh Woldetsadik, Dept. of Geography and Environmental Studies, AAU, and Dr. Belay Tefera, Dept. of Psychology, AAU, all provided lists of theses from which were drawn references related to HIV-AIDS. We are also grateful to Dr. Oluma Yoseph Bushen (Columbia University), Dr. Degnet Abebaw, Dr. Tefera Belachew, and Mr. Esayas Alemayehu (Jimma University) for their assistance in locating and compiling the list of publications that appeared in the Ethiopian Journal of Health Sciences and BSc and MD theses of students at Jimma University.

As always, the authors of this update continue to welcome corrections and suggestions that readers may have for future updates of the bibliography.
Section 1. Earlier Bibliographies on HIV/AIDS and Related Sociocultural and Economic Issues


Section 2. Basic Biomedical Research

This section covers laboratory-based biomedical research, including studies on HIV structure, replication, and host immune responses; co-infection with other agents; development and testing of laboratory procedures; and other related laboratory studies.


Section 3. Epidemiological, Risk Factors, and Determinants Research

This section includes studies on the epidemiology of HIV and other opportunistic infections, AIDS and related diseases, and risk and protective behaviors. It also covers research on the biological, psychosocial, socioeconomic, cultural, structural, and other contextual determinants of HIV transmission and prevention.


*Ethiop J. Health Dev*. 2006;20(1)
Section 4. Impacts Research

This section covers studies on the social, psychological, economic, and demographic impacts of HIV/AIDS on individuals, families, communities, institutions, or the nation. In addition, studies that explore relevant social issues associated with the spread of the HIV/AIDS are also included.
Section 5. Clinical Research

This section includes studies on the characteristics and clinical course of HIV infection and opportunistic infections, and other clinical issues affecting HIV/AIDS patients.


Section 6. Intervention Research

This section includes reports on research and programmatic activities that are aimed at provision of treatment, care, and support to people infected and affected by HIV. This section also includes reports on prevention efforts and public policy measures targeted against HIV/AIDS.


Section 7. Monitoring and Evaluation Research

This section includes reports that focus on HIV/AIDS related program or intervention monitoring and evaluation activities.


Section 8. HIV/AIDS Research on Ethiopians in the Diaspora

This section would cover HIV/AIDS among Ethiopians and foreign residents of Ethiopian origin living outside of Ethiopia. It includes basic science, epidemiology, intervention, clinical, impact and social issues research.


Section 9. Selected Websites Featuring HIV/AIDS in Ethiopia


2. Center for International Health of the University of Bergen, Norway: [http://www.cih.uib.no/journals/EJHD](http://www.cih.uib.no/journals/EJHD)

3. Christian Relief and Development Association: [www.crdaethiopia.org](http://www.crdaethiopia.org)

4. Ethiopian AIDS Resources Center: [http://www.etharc.org](http://www.etharc.org)


6. People to People: [www.peoplepeople.org](http://www.peoplepeople.org)


